Texas State Board of Public Accountancy

September 17, 2015

The Texas State Board of Public Accountancy met from 10:00 a.m. until 11:09 a.m. on September 17, 2015, at 333 Guadalupe, Tower 3, Suite 900, Austin, Texas 78701-3900. A notice of this meeting containing all items on the agenda was filed with the Office of the Secretary of State at 12:14 p.m. on September 3, 2015. (TRD #2015-006034) (ATTACHMENT 1)

Board Members Present

J. Coalter Baker, CPA Assistant Presiding Officer John R. Broaddus, CPA Jonathan B. Cluck, Esq. Rocky L. Duckworth, CPA *Member-at-Large* Donna J. Hugly, CPA Jon R. Keeney *Member-at-Large* William Lawrence Robert M. McAdams, CPA Steve D. Peña, CPA Phillip W. Worley

Board Members Absent

Everett R. Ferguson, CPA *Treasurer* excused James C. Flagg, PhD, CPA excused Susan Fletcher excused Maribess L. Miller, CPA *Secretary* excused Thomas G. Prothro, CPA *Presiding Officer* excused

Others Present

Frank McElroy, Esq. Sean McVey, CPA Bob Owen, CPA Mark Vane, Esq.

Staff Present

Paulette Beiter, Esq. Sandra Bradshaw Roel Cantu Ismael Castillo Karen Davis Alan Hermanson, CPA J. Randel Hill, Esq. Donna Hiller Joseph Jaffe Marissa Mahoney Virginia Moher, Esq., CPA Julie Prien Marisa Rios April Serrano William Treacy **Daniel Weaver**

I. Mr. Baker, Assistant Presiding Officer, called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. Mr. Treacy called roll and declared a quorum.

Mr. Keeney moved to excuse the absences of Mr. Ferguson, Dr. Flagg, Ms. Fletcher, Ms. Miller and Mr. Prothro from the September 17, 2015 Board meeting. Mr. Worley seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

At this time, Mr. Baker presented service awards to the following:

- 1. Paulette Beiter 5 years of service
- 2. Sandra Bradshaw 30 years of service
- 3. William Treacy 25 years of service
- II. Mr. Cluck moved to approve the July 23, 2015 Board meeting minutes as presented. Ms. Hugly seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.
- III. Mr. Baker, Executive Committee Member, reported on the September 16, 2015 committee meeting.

Members Present

Members Absent

J. Coalter Baker, CPA Rocky L. Duckworth, CPA Jon R. Keeney Everett R. Ferguson, CPA Maribess L. Miller, CPA Thomas G. Prothro, CPA

Others Present

Donna J. Hugly, CPA William Lawrence Staff Present

Karen Davis Alan Hermanson, CPA J. Randel Hill, Esq. Donna Hiller William Treacy Daniel Weaver

- A. Mr. Duckworth moved to approve the Board's financial statements as presented. Mr. Peña seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.
- B. Mr. Peña moved to approve the fee schedule for the FY 2016 budget and to ratify the FY 2016 Fifth-Year Accounting Students Scholarship Program allocation. Mr. Keeney seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.
- C. Mr. Keeney moved that the Board continue the internal audit program. Mr. McAdams seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.
- D. Mr. Baker asked members to select dates for Committee and Board meeting for CY 2016.
- E. The following was presented:
 - Mr. Baker reported on the following NASBA dates of interest:

 108th Annual Meeting
 October 25-28, 2015
 - 2. Mr. Keeney moved to name Mr. Baker as the Board's voting delegate at NASBA's 108th Annual Meeting. Mr. Cluck seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.
- F. Ms. Hugly moved to approve the following professional service contracts as presented. Mr. McAdams seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

FY 2016:

Behavioral Enforcement Committee consultants:

Benavioral Enforcement Committee				
On an as-needed basis – budget o		¢г 000		
Allen, Pinnix & Nichols, PA	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$5,000		
Technical Standards Review Commit	ttee consultants:			
1. Benjamin Gomez, CPA	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$10,000		
2. William Patrick Cantrell, CPA	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$25,000		
3. Harper & Pearson	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$145,000		
4. Davis Kinard & Co. P.C.	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$30,000		
5. Strasburger & Price, LLP	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$25,000		
6. Cook Brooks Johnson	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$15,000		
	_			
Peer Review Committee consultants	-	¢00.004		
1. John Mason Andres, CPA	9/1/15 - 8/31/16	\$22,694		
2. John Michael Waters, CPA		\$18,581		
3. Rebecca J. Teague, CPA	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$16,094		
Office of the Attorney General:	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$37,500		
State Office of Administrative Hearings:				
	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$25,742		
Internal Audit	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$25,000		
Peer Assistance (ACAN)	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$107,500		
Independent consultant contract (SC	OAH litigation):			
Mary Alice Boehm-McKaughan	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$76,500		
Sponsor Review Program consultant Master Reviewers:	ts:			
Ron Huntsman	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$150.00/hour		
Mitch Sutherlin	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$150.00/hour		

Reviewers:		
Kathy Abshire	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Richard Baland	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Michael Burnett	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Manuel Cavazos	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
David Crumbaugh	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Helen Cruz-Diaz	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Pamela Evans	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Jennifer Fadal	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
John Jones	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Connie Kelly	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Tim Madrigal	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Michael McMennamy	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Ray Newman	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Timothy Prebe	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Darlene Pulliam	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Janet Ann Smith	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Mark Turner	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Neal Van Zante	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Alva Winston	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour
Steve Wright	9/1/15 – 8/31/16	\$125.00/hour

FY 2015:

Office of the Attorney General 9/1/14 – 8/31/15 \$100,000 (To reflect actual contract amount. Projected expenditures for FY 2015 are estimated to be \$36,500)

- G. Mr. Baker reported on thank you notes from the public.
- H. Mr. Baker reported that Committee discussed if action should be taken by the Board on an exposure draft on the Statement on Standards for Continuing Professional Education (CPE) Programs (Standards). He noted that the committee will respond to the exposure draft prior to January, 2016.
- I. No action was taken on the appointment of Board's Nominating Committee.
- IV. Mr. Baker, Rules Committee Chair, reported on the Rules Committee meeting held September 16, 2015.

Members Present	Member Absent	Staff Present
J. Coalter Baker, CPA Rocky L. Duckworth, CPA William Lawrence Steve D. Peña, CPA	Maribess L. Miller, CPA Others Present Cliff Cavett, CPA Kevin Harris, CPA Donna Hugly, CPA Jon R. Keeney Tim LaFrey, Esq., CPA Frank McElroy, Esq. Gary McIntosh, CPA Bob Owen, CPA Bret Robertson, CPA Jack Savage, CPA	Karen Davis Tiffney Duncan Alan Hermanson, CPA J. Randel Hill, Esq. Donna Hiller Julie Prien Marisa Rios William Treacy Daniel Weaver

A. Mr. Baker reported that no action was taken and that staff will research the law on professional corporations (PC) to determine if a CPA firm's ownership is limited to a PC.

- B. Mr. Peña moved to authorize the executive director to publish the proposed revisions to Board Rule 527.4 (Enrollment & Participation) in the Texas Register for public comment. Ms. Hugly seconded the motion and it passed unanimously. (ATTACHMENT 2)
- C. The next committee meeting was scheduled for November 18, 2015.
- V. Ms. Hugly, Behavioral Enforcement Committee member, reported on the August 12, 2015 committee meetina.

Members Present	Member Absent	Staff Present
J. Coalter Baker, CPA John R. Broaddus, CPA Jonathan B. Cluck, Esq. Donald W. Harcum, CPA Donna J. Hugly, CPA James D. Ingram, IV, CPA Ben Peña, CFE, CPA	Maribess L. Miller, CPA	Paulette P. Beiter, Esq. J. Randel Hill, Esq.

- A. Mr. Keeney moved to dismiss the following investigations based on insufficient evidence of a violation of the Rules or Act. Mr. Worley seconded the motion and it passed.
 - 1. Investigation Nos. 15-03-23L¹ and 15-03-24L¹
 - 2. Investigation Nos. 15-05-01L¹ and 15-05-02L¹

 - Investigation Nos. 15-04-08L¹ and 15-04-09L¹
 Investigation Nos. 15-03-07L¹ and 15-03-08L¹
- B. Mr. Keeney moved to dismiss Investigation Nos. 15-04-02L¹ and 15-04-03L¹ due to voluntary compliance. Ms. Fletcher seconded the motion and it passed.
- C. Mr. Keeney moved to approve a request for the reinstatement of Wayne D. Chambers, a former licensee whose certificate was revoked by the Board as the result of **Investigation No. 11-01-08L**¹. Mr. Worley seconded the motion and it passed.
- D Other The committee considered 18 other investigations, which require no Board action at this time.
- E. The next committee meeting was scheduled for October 20, 2015.
- VI. Ms. Moher, Staff Attorney, reported on the status of the Enforcement Division's probation monitoring docket.
- VII. Mr. Hill, General Counsel, reported on the status of investigations into alleged violations of Subchapter J of the Public Accountancy Act, regarding the unauthorized practice of public accountancy.
- VIII. The Board took the following actions on Agreed Consent Orders, Proposals for Decisions, Agreed Cease and Desist Orders:

A. Agreed Consent Orders

Behavioral Enforcement Committee

Mr. Keeney moved to approve the following Agreed Consent Orders (ACOs) as presented. Mr. Peña seconded the motion and it passed.

1.	Investigation No.:	15-03-17L	Hometown:	Wills Point, TX
	Respondent:	Teresa Ann Byrd	Certificate No.:	058120
	Rule Violations:	501.74(b), 501.76, 501.90(12)		
	Act Violation:	901.502(6)		

Respondent entered into an ACO with the Board whereby Respondent was reprimanded. In addition, Respondent must pay an administrative penalty of \$500 and \$75.04 in administrative costs within 30 days of the date of the Board Order. Respondent failed to respond to a client's inquiry, failed to return a client's original records and failed to complete an engagement despite accepting a retainer fee.¹

2.	Investigation No.: Respondent: Rule Violations: Act Violations:	14-12-08L Alison Ann Eddy-Wilkins 501.90(12), 501.93 901.502(6), 901.502(11)	Hometown: Certificate No.:	Katy, TX 085578
	Respondent must pay an	an ACO with the Board whereby Re administrative penalty of \$5,000 an oard Order. Respondent failed to co ications. ¹	d \$2,500 in administrative	costs within 30
3.	Investigation Nos.: Respondents: Rule Violation:	14-08-05L & 14-08-06L Linda Fischer Ramsay & Linda F. Ramsay, CPA (Firm) 527.4	Hometown: Certificate No.: Firm License No.:	Rockwall, TX 089151 R00456
	reprimanded. In addition, date of the Board Order.	901.502(12) o an ACO with the Board whereby R Respondent must pay \$211.84 in a Respondent performed audits when o enroll in Peer Review within the re	dministrative costs within Respondent Firm was no	30 days of the
4.	Investigation No.: Respondent: Rule Violation: Act Violation:	14-06-04L Jack William Savage 501.74(b) 901.502(6)	Hometown: Certificate No.:	Dallas, TX 023465
	Respondent shall comple education (CPE) in the a nally, Respondent must p	an ACO with the Board whereby Re tet and submit proof of completion o rea of franchise tax in addition to Re bay \$1,558.31 in administrative costs d upon client-provided information to t. ²	of eight hours of continuing espondent's annual CPE re s within 30 days of the dat	professional equirement. Fi- e of the Board
5.	Investigation Nos.: Respondents: Rule Violations: Act Violations:	14-09-03L & 14-09-04L Sudhir P. Shah & Sudhir P. Shah (Firm) 501.90(7), 501.81 901.502(6), 901.502(12)	Hometown: F Certificate No.: Firm License No.:	lichardson, TX 024407 S01698
	reprimanded. In addition, ministrative costs within 3	o an ACO with the Board whereby R Respondent must pay an administr 30 days of the date of the Board Orc actice before the IRS on August 20, 2	ative penalty of \$500 and der. Respondent was place	\$107.20 in ad- ed under con-
6.	Investigation Nos.: Respondents: Rule Violations:	14-11-03L & 14-11-04L Elizabeth Ann Spinelli & Elizabeth Ann Spinelli (Firm) 501.74, 501.90(2)	Hometown: Certificate No.: Firm License No.:	Plano, TX 052273 S07724
	reprimanded. In addition, administrative costs with dated documentation to d	901.502(6) o an ACO with the Board whereby R Respondent must pay an administr in 30 days of the date of the Board C claim FNS credits in preparing client ormance of professional services. ²	ative penalty of \$2,500 an Drder. Respondents knowi	d \$225.14 in ngly used back-
7.	Investigation Nos.: Respondents:	15-03-19L & 15-03-20L James Joseph Towey & James J. Towey, P.C. (Firm)	Hometown: Certificate No.: Firm License No.:	Houston, TX 060493 C04781
	reprimanded. In addition, administrative costs with	501.74(d) 901.502(6) o an ACO with the Board whereby R Respondent must pay an administr in 30 days of the date of the Board O t fees pertaining to litigation support	ative penalty of \$1,000 an Drder. Respondent and Re	d \$139.37 in spondent Firm,

8.	Investigation Nos.:	15-02-10L & 15-02-11L	Hometown:	Arlington, TX
	Respondents:	Christopher John Wade &	Certificate No.:	054730
	-	Christopher J. Wade, CPA (Firm)	Firm License No.:	T09551
	Rule Violations:	501.90(12), 501.74		
	Act Violation:	901.502(6)		

Respondents entered into an ACO with the Board whereby Respondent and Respondent Firm were reprimanded. In addition, Respondent must pay an administrative penalty of \$750 and \$75.04 in administrative costs within 30 days of the date of the Board Order. Respondent and Respondent Firm failed to respond to a client's inquiry within a reasonable time without good cause and failed to exercise due professional care in the performance of professional services.²

9.	Investigation No.:	15-05-08L	Hometown:	Pasadena, TX
	Respondent:	Stuart Bruce Zidell	Certificate No.:	016258
	Rule Violation:	501.90(4)		
	Act Violations:	901.502(6), 901.502(10), 90	1.502(11)	

Respondent entered into an ACO with the Board whereby Respondent's certificate was revoked in lieu of further disciplinary action. Respondent pled guilty to bankruptcy fraud, a felony.

TECHNICAL STANDARDS REVIEW COMMITTEE (TSR)

Mr. Broaddus moved to approve the following Agreed Consent Orders (ACOs) as presented. Mr. Worley seconded the motion and it passed.

1.	Investigation Nos.:	15-03-11L & 15-05-04L	Hometown:	Austin, TX
	Respondents:	Frank Abram Ward &	Certificate No.:	021825
	-	Frank A. Ward, P.C. (Firm)	Firm License No.:	C06423
	Rule Violations:	527.4, 527.5		
	Act Violations:	901.502(6), 901.502(12)		

Respondents entered into an ACO with the Board whereby Respondents are subject to a scope limitation. Respondents shall not perform any attest service from the effective date of the Board Order until an application for removal of the limitation is found acceptable to the TSR Committee and ratified by the Board. During the term of scope limitation, Respondents are required to submit Limitation on Scope Affidavits every six months. Respondent Firm has received two successive deficient peer reviews and is no longer providing any attest work.³

2.	Investigation No.:	15-01-27L	Hometown:	Kerrville, TX
	Respondent:	Gregory R. Seibert (Firm)	Firm License No.:	T03619
	Rule Violations:	501.93, 527.5		
	Act Violations:	901.502(6), 901.502(12)		

Respondent entered into an ACO with the Board whereby Respondent agreed to obtain an accelerated peer review to be completed and the results reported to the Board by June 30, 2017. Should Respondent receive a rating of "pass" on a timely completed peer review, the Board will take no further disciplinary action related to the successive deficient peer reviews. Should Respondent not receive a rating of "pass" or fail to timely complete the accelerated peer review, the Board may take further disciplinary action in consideration of the firm's peer review record. Respondent received two successive deficient peer review rating.³

B. Mass Hearings

Mr. Keeney moved to approve the following Proposals for Decision as presented. Ms. Hugly seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

1. Respondents: In the Matter of Disciplinary Action Against Certain Licensees for Nonpayment of Professional Fees for Three Consecutive License Periods

The respondents failed to pay their licensing fees for three consecutive license periods. Following the public hearing, an Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) of the State Office of Administrative Hearings recommended that the certificate of each respondent not in compliance be revoked without prejudice. Each respondent may regain his or her certificate by paying all license fees and penalties and by otherwise coming into compliance with the *Act.* (ATTACHMENT 3)

Docket	Investigation Numbers	Scheduled Hearing
457-15-2667	15-04-10001 – 15-04-10030	May 26, 2015
457-15-3218	15-05-10001 – 15-05-10037	June 30, 2015

2. Respondents: In the Matter of Disciplinary Action Against Certain License Holders for CPE Delinquencies

The respondents failed to comply with CPE reporting requirements found in *Chapter 523* of the *Rules* and *Section 901.411* of the *Act*. Following the scheduled public hearing, an Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) of the State Office of Administrative Hearings recommended that the license of each respondent not in compliance be suspended for a period of three years, or until he or she complies with the licensing requirements of the *Act*, whichever is sooner. Additionally, the ALJ recommended a \$100 penalty be imposed for each year a respondent is not in compliance with the Board's CPE requirements. (ATTACHMENT 4)

Docket	Investigation Numbers	Scheduled Hearing
457-15-2668	15-04-10031 – 15-02-10193	May 26, 2015
457-15-3219	15-05-10038 – 15-05-10167	June 30, 2015

3. Respondents: In the Matter of Disciplinary Action Against Certain Certificate Holders for Failure to Complete License Notice

The respondents failed to complete their license renewal notices in accordance with Section 515.3 of the Board's *Rules*. Following a public hearing, an Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) of the State Office of Administrative Hearings recommended that the certificate of each respondent not in compliance be revoked without prejudice until such time as the respondent complies with the requirements of the *Rules* and the *Act.* (ATTACHMENT 5)

Docket	Investigation Numbers	Scheduled Hearing
457-15-2669	15-04-10194 – 15-04-10203	May 26, 2015
457-15-3220	15-05-10168 – 15-05-10175	June 30, 2015

C. Cease and Desist Orders

Ms. Hugly moved to approve the following Cease and Desist Orders (CDOs) as presented. Mr. Broaddus seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

1.	Investigation No.:	15-03-19N	Hometown:	Carrollton, TX
	Respondent:	Robert Lamson		
	Act Violation:	901.451		

Staff initiated an investigation of this matter based on evidence that Respondent was using terms reserved by the *Act* for individuals and entities holding licenses issued by the Board. Staff determined that Respondent has not held individual or firm licenses issued by the Board during all relevant times. Respondent used the designation "CPA." This action constitutes a violation of *Act Section 901.451*. Respondent offered services to the public that involve the use of accounting, attest or auditing skills. Offering these services while representing to the public that he is licensed by the Board is the practice of public accountancy under *Section 901.003* of the *Act*. Respondent repeatedly failed to respond to the Board's attempts to gain Respondent's compliance. It was therefore necessary for the Board to immediately issue a CDO against Respondent.

2.	Investigation No.:	15-02-12N	Hometown:	Gladewater, TX
	Respondent:	Deena L. Berry dba Deena's CPA Services		
	Act Violation:	901.451		

Staff initiated an investigation of this matter based on evidence that Respondent was using terms reserved by the *Act* for individuals and entities holding licenses issued by the Board. Staff determined that Respondent has not held individual or firm licenses issued by the Board during all relevant times. Respondent used the designation "CPA." This action constitutes a violation of *Act Section 901.451*. Respondent offered services to the public that involve the use of accounting, attest or auditing skills. Offering these services while representing to the public that she is licensed by the Board is the practice of public accountancy under *Section 901.003* of the *Act*. Respondent repeatedly failed to respond to the Board's attempts to gain Respondent's compliance. It was therefore necessary for the Board to immediately issue a CDO against Respondent.

D. Agreed Cease and Desist Orders

Mr. Broaddus moved to approve the following Agreed Cease and Desist Orders (ACDOs) as presented. Ms. Hugly seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

1.	Investigation No.:	15-06-10N	Hometown:	Cypress, TX
	Respondents:	Linda V. Ezernack, Shaun L. Ezernack,		
	-	and LS Financial Services Inc.		
	Act Violations:	901.451, 901.453, 901.456	5	

Respondents entered into an ACDO with the Board whereby Respondents will cease and desist from providing attest services and using reserved terms until or unless Respondents comply with the registration and licensing provisions of the *Act*, and until or unless Respondents have obtained a license to practice accountancy in Texas. Respondents used the titles "certified public accountants" and "accountant" and offered to provide attest services, specifically audits, reviews and compilations, although Respondents do not hold licenses in Texas. This action constitutes a violation of *Act Sections 901.451*, *901.453* and *901.456*.

2.	Investigation No.:	15-07-08N	Hometown:	Pearland, TX
	Respondent:	Joyce Arnold		
	Act Violations:	901.453, 901.456		

Respondent entered into an ACDO with the Board whereby Respondent will cease and desist from providing attest services and using reserved terms until or unless Respondent complies with the registration and licensing provisions of the *Act*, and until or unless Respondent has obtained a license to practice accountancy in Texas. Respondent used the title "accountant," offered "accounting services" and provided an attest service, specifically a review, although Respondent does not hold licenses in Texas. This action constitutes a violation of *Act Sections 901.453* and *901.456*.

- IX. Mr. Keeney moved to adopt the following Rules as presented. Mr. Broaddus seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.
 - 1. Section 512.6 (Reciprocal Fee) (ATTACHMENT 6)
 - 2. Section 515.5 (Reinstatement of a Certificate or License in the Absence of a Violation of the Board's Rules of Professional Conduct) (ATTACHMENT 7)
 - 3. Section 515.11 (Exemption from Payment of the Professional Fee for Other than State of Texas Government Employees) REPEAL
 - 4. Section 515.12 (Exemption from Payment of the Professional Fee for State of Texas Employees) REPEAL
 - 5. Section 521.1 (Individual License Fees) (ATTACHMENT 8)
 - 6. Section 521.7 (Fee for Transfer of Credits) (ATTACHMENT 9)
 - 7. Section 521.8 (Retired or Disabled Status) (ATTACHMENT 10)
 - 8. Section 521.9 (Certification Fee) (ATTACHMENT 11)
 - 9. Section 521.12 (Filing Fee) (ATTACHMENT 12)
 - 10. Section 521.14 (Eligibility Fee) (ATTACHMENT 13)
- X. Mr. Baker reviewed the schedule of future Board meetings.
- XI. Mr. Baker adjourned the meeting at 11:09 a.m.

ATTEST:

J. Coalter Baker, CPA, Presiding Officer

Steve D. Peña, CPA, Secretary

¹ Mr. Baker, Mr. Broaddus, Mr. Cluck and Ms. Hugly recused themselves from participating in this matter.

² Mr. Baker, Mr. Broaddus and Ms. Hugly recused themselves from participating in this matter.

³ Mr. Duckworth, Mr. Keeney, and Mr. Peña recused themselves from participating in this matter.